



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/532,409	09/26/2005	Alastair J. T. Clemow	051892-0113	9135
22428	7590	01/21/2010	EXAMINER	
FOLEY AND LARDNER LLP			COMSTOCK, DAVID C	
SUITE 500				
3000 K STREET NW			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
WASHINGTON, DC 20007			3733	
			MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
			01/21/2010	PAPER

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

<b>Office Action Summary</b>	<b>Application No.</b>	<b>Applicant(s)</b>	
	10/532,409	CLEMOW ET AL.	
	<b>Examiner</b>	<b>Art Unit</b>	
	DAVID COMSTOCK	3733	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

#### Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

#### Status

1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 06 August 2009.  
 2a) This action is **FINAL**.                    2b) This action is non-final.  
 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

#### Disposition of Claims

4) Claim(s) 1-42 is/are pending in the application.  
 4a) Of the above claim(s) 1-20,35 and 38 is/are withdrawn from consideration.  
 5) Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.  
 6) Claim(s) 21,23-34,36,37 and 39-42 is/are rejected.  
 7) Claim(s) 22 is/are objected to.  
 8) Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

#### Application Papers

9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.  
 10) The drawing(s) filed on 22 April 2005 is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.  
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).  
 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

#### Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).  
 a) All    b) Some \* c) None of:  
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.  
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.  
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

#### Attachment(s)

1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ .
3) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date <u>2/12/09 (copy)</u> .	5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application
	6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ .

## DETAILED ACTION

### ***Information Disclosure Statement***

A copy of the Information Disclosure Statement filed on 12 February 2009 and first considerd on 10 May 2009 has been included with this Office action. The attached copy includes initials and an indication that the references were considered.

### ***Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102***

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(e) the invention was described in (1) an application for patent, published under section 122(b), by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent or (2) a patent granted on an application for patent by another filed in the United States before the invention by the applicant for patent, except that an international application filed under the treaty defined in section 351(a) shall have the effects for purposes of this subsection of an application filed in the United States only if the international application designated the United States and was published under Article 21(2) of such treaty in the English language.

Claims 21, 23-34, 36, 37 and 39-42 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(e) as being anticipated by Justin et al. (2003/0220697; of record).

Justin et al. discloses the claimed invention including a plurality of segments, e.g., 164, 165, having a femoral fixation surface and assembly surfaces, e.g., 166, 168 (see, e.g., Figs. 9, 12 and 16). The segments comprise self-alignment structures, e.g., 230, 232 (e.g., Fig. 16A), pins or bolts, etc., e.g., 240 (id.), and assembly surfaces extending in a plane extending in a proximal-distal direction and an anterior-posterior direction (e.g., Fig. 12). The segments form a continuous bearing surface. The segments can be separately inserted to facilitate a minimally-invasive surgery. The

edges necessarily are recessed below the continuous bearing surface, and it is because of this that the edges exist in the first place. Justin et al. discloses also the claimed method including the steps of providing a plurality of segments, e.g., 164, 165, each of said segments having a femoral fixation surface adapted to be positioned on a distal end of a femur and at least one assembly surface, e.g., 166, 168, adapted to be joined to an assembly surface of an adjacent one of said segments; and selecting segment sizes configured to position the assembly surfaces of the segments at a desired location when implanted on a distal end of a femur (see, e.g., Figs. 9, 12, 16A and para. 0076).

#### ***Allowable Subject Matter***

Claim 22 is objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

#### ***Response to Arguments***

Applicant's arguments filed 06 August 2009 have been considered but are not fully persuasive.

It is first noted that Applicant's argument that the device does not comprise beveled corners is persuasive. Therefore, claim 22, which recites this limitation has not been rejected and would be allowable if amended as noted above. However, regarding the amendment to claim 21, it is noted that edges of the mutually contacting assembly surfaces on portions of the assembly surfaces closest to the generally continuous

bearing surface are still the same edges and are still recessed below the generally continuous surface. The assembly surfaces are positioned in a predetermined location, and whether they "minimize contact" with a patella depends on factors outside the scope of the claims. Moreover, based on the figures cited in the rejection, it appears that the assembly surfaces are positioned in a groove. In addition, regarding the method claims, limitations directed to specific structure that do not affect the steps of the method have not been given patentable weight.

***Conclusion***

**THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL.** Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to David Comstock whose telephone number is (571) 272-4710 (a detailed message should be left if Examiner is unavailable). If attempts to

reach the Examiner by telephone or voicemail are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Eduardo Robert, can be reached at (571) 272-4719. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

/David Comstock/

Examiner, Art Unit 3733

/Eduardo C. Robert/

Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 3733